

# ALL INDIA TELECOM EXECUTIVE & ENGINEERS ASSOCIATION

(Together We Gan)

(A Joint Initiative by Executives of BSNL)

To,
The Director (HR)
BSNL Board
Corporate Office, New Delhi.

Subject: Pay loss issue of Direct Recruited JTO/ JAOs of BSNL recruited after 01.01.2007 in the light of 2<sup>nd</sup> PRC – Regarding.

Respected Madam, Greetings!!

With deep regards for your esteemed self, "ALL INDIA TELECOM EXECUTIVE & ENGINEERS ASSOCIATION" wish to apprise you about an important HR issue which has been overlooked since seven years, however a ray of hope has enlighten all of us when your esteemed self joined as HR Head of this company and started focusing, addressing & resolving all pending HR issues amicably. This issue could be well understood under following category:

## 1. What is the issue of the pay loss?

This issue is concerned with pay scale of all those Direct Recruited Executives (DRE) in the cadre of JTO & JAOs recruited after 01.01.2007 by BSNL. The notified pay scale for these JTO/JAOs was E1A (Pre revised 9850-250-14600). At the time of fixation pay of these incumbent Executives, dual standard was adopted by BSNL Establishment. On one hand, for Executives who were recruited before 01.01.2007, Rs.9850/ (initial basic) was fixed at Rs.22, 820/ whereas on the other hand, for post 01.01.2007 Executives the same Rs.9850/ has been fixed at Rs19, 020/. As conspicuous Rs 22820/- is 20% higher than Rs 19020/- & therefore those recruited after 1.1.2007 has been pushed *back to* one step below to the existing PRC & in totality this led to these employees a total loss of at least Rs10,000/-(approx.)per month since last six to seven years.

### 2. Why should the basic of Post 01.01.2007 be fixed at Rs 22,820/?

The recommendations of 2<sup>nd</sup>PRC and even in7<sup>th</sup> CPC have specifically followed the notion that there must not be any gap between fixations of same pay scale between existing & incumbent Executives. The2nd PRC kept these facts into consideration and recommended five different sets of revised scale and fitment namely A+, A, B, C, D. Fitment for A+ type CPSE was recommended to 30 % and for D type CPSE 3 %. Based on this, E1 scale for A+ type CPSE was recommended to 20700-33800 and E1 scale for D type CPSE 16400-27000. The same for E2, E3, E4 etc. Therefore in

@ Reg. No. Society/771/2016-17



# ALL INDIA TELECOM EXECUTIVE & ENGINEERS ASSOCIATION

(Together We Gan)

(A Joint Initiative by Executives of BSNL)

each type of CPSE there was a relation between fitment (for pre revision appointee) and revised scale (for post revision appointee). Thereby in 2nd PRC recommendation the minimum of revised scale was incorporated with the quantum of fitment and the harmony between pre revised basic and minimum of revised basic was fine. But DPE selected randomly A+ type fitment and D type revised scale for each CPSE. Thus relation between pre and post pay revision basic got broken. Keeping this fact into consideration, DPE had not issued any guidelines to appoint only at the minimum of revised scale for post 01.01.2007 appointed Executives.

7th CPC clearly says about Entry Pay and it is the first cell of each level of table 5. First cell is nothing but the Entry Pay in 5th CPC multiplied by multiplication factor/Index (This index comes after merging DA & Fitment.) This index was  $1.782 \times 1.3 = 2.31$  for 2nd PRC. Table 7 clears it with example. For level L3 the post revision appointed will get initial basic of 21700, whereas the pre revision appointed will get 8460 x 2.57 which is exactly equal to 21700 / after round figure. In 7th CPC report where the minimum of revised scale is exactly equal to minimum of old basic multiplied by multiplication factor, the difference in basic of an employee appointed in pre revised scale just before 01.01.2016 and after 01.01.2016 is exactly zero. Another Example: Entry Pay was Rs.18150/ for level 7 (for GP 4800/ scale) and multiplication factor is 2.62. Rs.18150/ x 2.62 = Rs 47553/ and the proposed entry pay for this level is Rs.47600/. In effect, there is not a single rupee of difference between pre & post recruited employee.

#### 3. Why did this anomaly arise?

This all happened due to adoption of a general word "minimum" from FR-22. Had this "minimum" been a part & parcel of Executive pay revision, it would have been mentioned in pay revision order issued by either of three i.e. DPE, DOT or BSNL, like in non-executives case BSNL mentioned it specifically (in para 2.2). But in case of Executive pay revision case, none of these three i.e. DPE, DOT or BSNL mentioned it. Even 6th CPC had not stick to word "minimum", instead used "entry pay" word which was more elaborative than the "minimum" to maintain the harmony between pre & post appointed Executives. This use of generality of "minimum" led a blunder by BSNL Establishment while inferring DPE OMs dated 26/11/2008 and 02/04/2009 regarding implementation of the revision of pay scale of post 2007 DRE JTO/JAOs of second PRC. BSNL management itself presumed its own and issued in a writing vide No.7-1/2013-PAT (BSNL) dated11-02-14 at Para (VII) that officers who joins after 01.01.2007 gets fixed at "minimum" of corresponding pay scale. However in RTI reply from additional secretary in DPE, vide no. W-03/0019/2016-DPE (WC) dated 04/03/2016, has categorically denied that it had issued any such guidelines on the pay fixation of Executives on the minimum of pay scale. In turn, DPE had given full scope to employer to redress & remove the gap between Executives joining before & after implementation of 2<sup>nd</sup> PRC.



# ALL INDIA TELECOM EXECUTIVE & ENGINEERS ASSOCIATION

(Together We Gan)
(A Joint Initiative by Executives of BSNL)

## 4. What are the adverse effects of this assumption of "minimum"?

The adverse effects of this presumption led BSNL Establishment to issue several special &onetime dispensation orders. Surprising but it is a drab fact that due to this presumption of "minimum" of pay scale, BSNL has to quash its own order No.1-37/2010-PAT (BSNL) dated 18/05/2011 and has to issue order No. 7-4/2010-SEA-BSNL (Pt-1) dated 24/07/2015 as one time dispensation .Once again BSNL management has to issue another one time dispensation window for JTOs of 2005 batch appointed after 01.01.2007 vide order No. 1-14/2009-PAT(BSNL)dated16/04/2010. Ridiculous but this is noted fact that this one time dispensation window has been opened three times.

**5.** Is there any guideline/hurdle against this fixation of Rs 22820/- for post 01.01.2007 DREs? No, RTI reply from DPE & DOT says that there is no hindrance in fixation of Rs 22820/ for the post 01.01.2007 DRE of BSNL. (RTI reply enclosed).

Therefore in the light of above facts it is requested kindly to take the personal cognizance of the said anomaly & arrange to fix the pay of DR JTO/JAOs recruited after 01.01.2007 at Rs. 22820/-, fulfilling the very purpose of 2<sup>nd</sup> PRC as time is running out with formation of 3rd PRC.

Anticipating positive response from your esteemed self.

With Regards,

Yours Sincerely

Manoj Singh 13/07/10/6

**General Secretary** 

Capy to: 6M(EC+6). (1) 19/16